










Investigation of Effectiveness Studies Conducted by Using Cognitive Behavioral Group Therapy, Psychodrama and Art Therapy in Turkey

Türkiye’de Bilişsel Davranışçı Grup Terapisi, Psikodrama ve Sanat Terapisi Kullanılarak Yapılmış Etkililik Çalışmalarının İncelenmesi

Füsun Gökkaya¹ , Elifnur Zorluoğlu² , İrem Işık² , Büşra Önkür² , Tuğba Bozdemir² ,
Rukiye Kızıltan² , Canan Mıh² , Süleyman Salıkyüz² , Cennet Deniz² 

Abstract

The aim of this study was to review the studies conducted in Turkey which evaluated the effectiveness of cognitive behavioral group therapy, psychodrama, and art group therapy programs. Articles only in Turkish that were published between 2000-2018 were searched by using specified keywords in Ebscohost, Ulakbim, DergiPark, Turkish Psychiatry Index, and Google Scholar databases. Among the articles, studies which were not effectiveness studies, those which did not have CBT group therapy, psychodrama, art therapy, those which did not indicate the effectiveness of the therapy, those which were thesis, case reports, studies that using two different group therapies, and psychoeducation and psychological counseling programs were excluded from the review. A total of 27 studies that met the inclusion criteria were included. Studies were examined in terms of research method, samples, therapy characteristics, and obtained results. The results showed that CBT group therapy, psychodrama, and art therapy were effective in alleviating different problems. Examined results suggested that more experimental and effectiveness studies regarding group psychotherapy are needed

Keywords: Cognitive behavioral group therapy, psychodrama, art therapy, effectiveness

Öz

Bu çalışmanın amacı bilişsel davranışçı grup terapisi (BDGT), psikodrama ve sanat grup psikoterapisi kullanılarak ülkemizde yapılmış etkililik çalışmalarını incelemektir. Bu amacı gerçekleştirmek için Ebscohost, Ulakbim, Dergi Park, Türk Psikiyatri Dizini ve Google Akademik veri tabanlarında 2000- 2018 yılları arasında yayınlanan yalnızca Türkçe makaleler, belirlenen anahtar kelimeler ile taranmıştır. Tarama sonucunda ulaşılan makalelerden etkililik çalışması olmayanlar, uygulanan psikoterapi çalışması BDGT, psikodrama ve sanat terapisi olmayanlar, psikoterapi etkililik sonucunu bildirmeyenler, tez çalışmaları, iki farklı grup terapisini kullanan çalışmalar, olgu sunumları, psikoeğitim ve psikolojik danışmanlık programı ile yapılan çalışmaların makaleleri incelemeden çıkarılmıştır. Dışlama ve dahil etme ölçütlerini karşılayan 27 makale değerlendirmeye alınmıştır. Bu makaleler terapi özellikleri, örneklem grubu, araştırma yöntemleri ve elde edilen sonuçlar bakımından incelenmiştir. Sonuçlar farklı sorunları azaltmada, BDGT, psikodrama ve sanat psikoterapisi uygulamalarının etkili müdahaleler olduğunu göstermiştir. Yapılan incelemeler daha fazla deneysel desenli grup psikoterapisiyle yapılmış etkililik çalışmalarına gereksinim duyulduğunu düşündürmüştür.

Anahtar sözcükler: Bilişsel davranışçı grup terapisi, psikodrama, sanat terapisi, etkililik

¹ Near East University, Nicosia, TRNC

² İzmir Katip Çelebi University, İzmir, Turkey

✉ Füsun Gökkaya, Near East University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Department of Psychology, Nicosia, TRNC
fusungokkaya@hotmail.com

Received: 23.05.2019 | Accepted: 31.07.2019 | Published online: 20.11.2019

IN THE BROAD SENSE, psychotherapy refers to psychological methods of help and cure (Öztürk 2008). The psychotherapy process is based upon the close relationship established between two people and includes trying new behaviors and learning trials of such behavior as well as encompassing the dynamics of interpersonal relationships (Linden and Hewitt 2015). Psychotherapy is used as a treatment method applied in individual and group formats and utilizes various theoretical perspectives. Group psychotherapy is widely used for treating psychological disorders. Humans, due to their nature, live in various groups and interact with each other. Considering this interaction, group psychotherapy becomes a part of people's real lives (Arslantaş and Dereboy 2016). Group psychotherapies were first applied in the 1940's (Yalom 2002) and reached today as a common therapy method based upon different approaches. Group psychotherapy provides that the therapist helps multiple people simultaneously and uses resources in a more effective way. In group psychotherapy, various therapeutic factors come to the forefront such as information sharing, group coherence and support, acceptance of the person and his/her experiences, interpersonal knowledge acquisition, getting to know oneself better, discovering how others are affected by one's behavior, learning how others affect the person, discovering how one's inner reality produces obstacles, giving hope, motivation for treatment, altruism, learning from others, normalization, and guidance (Yalom 2002). In psychotherapies, it is aimed to alleviate symptoms, increase social adaptation, and reduce cognitive losses and dysfunction. Efforts to share common experiences via interactions, education, and support that constitute group dynamics; provide feedback on social behaviors; and to develop new social skills are prominent (Kızılkaya and Gündüz 2012).

In terms of theoretical perspectives, group psychotherapy methods are as abundant as individual psychotherapy methods. For instance, methods including existential therapy, Gestalt therapy, cognitive behavioral group psychotherapy (CBGP), solution focused therapy, psychodrama, and art therapy are based upon different theoretical underpinnings. In group psychotherapy, deteriorated interpersonal relationships are focused on and it is aimed to increase patients' relationship skills. Group psychotherapies which are directed appropriately by therapists reduce interpersonal conflicts and increase the participation of withdrawn group members. People learn to trust each other through psychotherapy processes and thus coherence is formed (Yalom 2002). A review of the international literature revealed that group psychotherapies are widely used and effectiveness studies regarding group psychotherapies exist in abundance. For example, in a study by Braga et al. (2005), 42 people with obsessive-compulsive disorder (OCD) underwent a 12-session CBGT program and it was found that CBGT was effective in reducing OCD symptoms. In another study, the effect of dance and movement therapy on schizophrenia patients were examined. The experiment group consisting of 12 patients received dance and movement therapy for 12 weeks. It was found that the experiment group had significant reductions in anger and depression levels compared to the control group (Lee et al. 2015). In one study, patients with panic disorder received 25 sessions of psychodrama which lasted for 6 months. It was determined that the patients experienced reductions in their anxiety symptoms (Tarashoeva et al. 2017). The literature contains a large number of international effectiveness studies regarding group psychotherapies. This led us to investigating and comparing the content, outcomes, and findings of Turkish effectiveness studies regarding CBGP, psychodrama, and art therapy.

In the current study, it was aimed to examine effectiveness studies conducted in Turkey with regard to CBGP, psychodrama, and art therapy. For this purpose CBGP, psychodrama, and art therapy effectiveness trials published between the years 2000 and 2018 were evaluated. These trials were evaluated in terms of group size, number of sessions, duration of sessions, and diagnostic criteria used for selecting patients.

Methods of group psychotherapy

Group psychotherapies aim to provide services to more than one person simultaneously. In most of these therapies, the importance of interpersonal relationships is stressed. In addition, group psychotherapies are preferred because they are effective and economic (Kramer et al. 2014). In the following section, brief descriptions of CBGP, psychodrama, and art therapy, which have all been tested for effectiveness in Turkey, are provided.

1. CBGP

Cognitive behavioral therapy (CBT) was developed by Aaron T. Beck in the 1960's at the Pennsylvania University, which is located in the USA and was used as a treatment for depression initially (Beck 2001, Türkçapar 2015). CBT, a therapy method based on principles of learning, has been scientifically shown to be effective in numerous psychological disorders as a result of many clinical studies (Türkçapar 2015). According to the cognitive behavioral approach, distorted or dysfunctional thoughts lead to psychological problems and affect one's emotions and behaviors. These thoughts (cognitions) need to be reevaluated in a realistic way and changed with functional cognitions in order to modify emotions and behaviors and thus treat the person. Permanent improvement is established via the modification of core negative beliefs. In CBT, not only daily problems are addressed and patients are taught skills that can be used lifelong for solving various problems (Beck 2001, Türkçapar 2015). According to the CBT approach, the source of psychological problems is dysfunctional thinking patterns or absence of positive-appropriate behavioral coping strategies. The aim of this approach is to regulate effective coping strategies and problem solving skills through decreasing cognitive biases or distortions (O'Connor and Creswell 2005). In CBT, it is aimed to increase patients' awareness of their own thoughts and feelings. In this context, various skills are developed and the effect of situations, thoughts, and behaviors on emotions are identified, followed by reframing dysfunctional thoughts and behaviors in order to change feelings (Cully and Teten 2008). In CBT, cognitive techniques (psychoeducation, increasing treatment motivation, testing evidence, fighting cognitive distortions, cognitive reframing, self-instructions or self-talk, self-awareness and self-monitoring, problem solving training, imagination, thought stopping, evaluating pros and cons) and behavioral techniques (activity planning, role playing, behavioral experiments, relaxation, systematic desensitization, social skills training, self-monitoring, token management, distraction, exposure) are selected and used based upon the needs of the group members (Mennuti et al. 2006). CBGP is distinct from individual CBT in two ways. First, modeling and operant strategies are more often used in the group format. Second, the interaction between group members significantly contributes to the therapeutic process in the former (Rose 1998).

2. Art therapy

As a result of the need to achieve improvement with a limited number of therapy sessions, short term therapies emerged. One of these therapy methods is art therapy. Re-

search conducted by art therapists showed that artistic activities help people demonstrate their problems in a fast way and thus hasten assessment and intervention. Art therapy is an expressionist psychotherapy which utilizes dance, music, art, theatre, movement, etc. and was developed within the last 40-50 years (Malchiodi 2012).

The use of art in treating disorders has a long history. In art therapy, the therapist can have a psychoanalytical, cognitive behavioral or existential orientation (Aydın 2012). Art therapists who do not interfere with the patients' creative expressions and work as a member of the group mostly work at hospitals and institutions that serve people with intellectual disabilities. Art therapists place importance upon artistic equipment and materials in order to elicit creativity and thus reach therapeutic change among patients (Sharf 2016). In this therapy, art is used as an instrument. The art produced by patients help them to form a more adaptive relationship between their inner and outer reality, whether this product meets aesthetic standards or not (Güney 2011). Art provides a free environment for the patients and help them regain control of their lives. It also elicits feelings of helplessness and hopelessness through artistic expression and helps patients acquire skills for controlling and coping with such feelings (Demir 2018b). Through art therapy, people meet with others for a shared goal and engage in various activities instead of living isolated lives. In the psychotherapy process, use of an artistic component between the therapist and the patient facilitates the expression of unsaid feelings and thoughts. In this way, art therapy contributes to people's emotion expressions, helping them identify and report their feelings and thus solve interpersonal problems (Sarandöl et al. 2013).

3. Psychodrama

Psychodrama is a therapy approach conducted through dramatization (spontaneous theatre). In psychodrama therapy, group members act upon psychological problems and interact through action. During enactments, catharsis is achieved, leading to insight and healthier behaviors (Altınay 1999). In psychodrama, daily interpersonal problems are first focused on. Associations point to the past, forgotten or repressed problems which provide a foundation for daily distress. Patients are helped to identify and modify their core problems and blind spots (Özbek and Leutz 2003). The psychodrama process helps people develop spontaneity, empathy, and creativity. As a result, people experience positive changes in their mood, communication and coping skills (Oğuzhanoglu and Özdel 2005). Psychodrama is initiated with warm-up games which prepares group members for the process. It continues with a protagonist game where the protagonist prepares the stage for an enactment and chooses group members for the stage. In the last phase of psychodrama, namely sharing, role feed-backs and self-sharing takes place (Gökkaya and Özdel 2016). Techniques such as role switching, pairing, and the mirror are based upon enacting one's self or another. Psychodrama helps people understand how they behave and feel when they are in a certain role and provides the opportunity to regulate their behavior. It also increases feeling of control through role playing. Enactment of abstract topics, increases in emotions tied to such topics, and overt expression of feelings lead people to take action to solve real life problems (Sharf 2016).

Method

In the current study, it was aimed to examine Turkish studies which investigated the effectiveness of CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy. Ebscohost, Ulakbim, DergiPark,

Turkish Psychiatry Index, Google Scholar databases were used in order to search for articles in Turkish published between the years 2000 and 2018. In the search, the keywords used were as follows: “CBGT”, “psychodrama”, “art therapy”, “effectiveness”, and “group therapy”. The literature search was carried out between November and December of the year 2018. A total of 59 articles were found and 32 were excluded from the current study. exclusion criteria included not being an effectiveness study; using a psychotherapy method other than CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy; not reporting effectiveness findings; being thesis and dissertations; being a case study; and including a psychoeducation and psychological counseling program. A total of 27 articles that met the inclusion criteria were examined. Among these, 8 was on CBGT, 13 were on psychodrama, and 6 were on art therapy. In each study, we focused on sample characteristics such as group size and diagnostic criteria for patient selection, treatment types, comparison groups, and instruments used for assessing effectiveness. Studies conducted with children, adolescents, and adults were examined together. Information regarding the studies examined were shown in Table 1. Studies were presented on the table according to their dates of publication and older studies were followed by newer ones.

Results

Methodological characteristics of the studies

Sample

Age and gender distribution

It was found that the youngest age range (11-13 years of age) was in Gökkaya and Sütcü (2018) and Öngider and Baykara (2015), while the oldest age range (60-87 years of age) was in Oğuzhanoglu and Özdel's (2005) study. In studies by Gökkaya and Özdel (2016), Bal and Şener (2015), Karataş (2014), and Yazkaç and Özkan (2018); the age range of the participants was not mentioned. In 21 studies, the sample consisted of adults (e.g. Oğuzhanoglu and Özdel 2005); in 3 studies, adolescents aged between 14-18 years were recruited (Karataş 2011, Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Sütcü et al. 2010), in 3 studies, children aged between 10-14 years were included in the sample (Öngider and Baykara 2015, Gedik et al. 2018, Gökkaya and Sütcü 2018).

In the majority of studies, the male-female ratio was similar. The male-female ratio was not reported in 3 articles (Coşkun and Çakmak 2005, Ulupınar 2014, Yazkaç and Özkan 2018). Some studies included female participants only (Sertöz and Mete 2005, Karadağ et al. 2010, Akbıyık et al. 2012), while others included male participants only (Oğuzhanoglu and Özdel 2005, Mortan et al. 2010). In some studies, the rate of female participants was higher than the rate of male participants (Şafak et al. 2014, Bulduk et al. 2015, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Varma et al. 2017, Demir 2017, Demir and Demir 2018, Gedik et al. 2018). In Demir's (2018a) study, the rate of male participants was higher than the rate of female participants.

Diagnosis

The participants in CBGT studies consisted of people with OCD (Şafak et al. 2014), anxiety disorders (Öngider and Baykara 2015), schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder (Mortan et al. 2010), and anxious children (Gedik et al. 2018). In art therapy studies, the sample included schizophrenia patients and their relatives (Sarandöl et al. 2013), people with mild dementia (Bulduk et al. 2015), and physical therapy and rehabilitation patients

(Yazkaç and Özkan 2018). In psychodrama studies, addicts being treated at the AMATEM (Coşkun and Çakmak 2005), people diagnosed with mild-moderate major depression (Varma et al. 2017), people with psoriasis (Karadağ et al. 2010), and breast cancer patients (Akbiyık and ark. 2012) were included.

In the remaining studies, the samples consisted of normal subjects such as university students, high school students, elementary school students, and guidance teachers (Oğuzhanoğlu and Özdel 2005, Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Sütücü et al. 2010, Karataş 2011, Karataş 2014, Ulupınar 2014, Bal and Şener 2015, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Demir 2017, Bakalım et al. 2018, Demir and Demir 2018, Gökkaya and Sütücü 2018).

Sample size

Among CBGT studies, the smallest sample size was 12 participants in Demir's (2018a) and Mortan et al.'s (2010) studies. The highest number of participants (54 people) was in Gökkaya and Sütücü's (2018) study. Among art therapy studies, the smallest sample size was 10 participants in Demir and Demir's (2018) study, while the highest number of participants was found to be in Yazkaç and Özkan's (2018) study (50 people). Among psychodrama studies, the lowest number of participants was found to be in Karadağ et al.'s (2010) study (7 people), while the highest was in Bakalım et al.'s (2018) study (46 people).

Treatment and control/comparison groups

In 8 of the articles examined, an experiment group receiving group psychotherapy and a control group which did not receive any intervention were found (Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Mortan et al. 2010, Sütücü et al. 2010, Bal and Şener 2015, Öngider and Baykara 2015, Bakalım et al. 2018, Gedik et al. 2018, Yazkaç and Özkan 2018). In 3 studies, both a control and a placebo group could be found (Karataş 2011, Karataş 2014, Gökkaya and Sütücü 2018). In Demir and Demir's (2018) study, an experiment group receiving group psychotherapy and a placebo control group was included in the study design. In the remaining studies, only an experiment group which received group psychotherapy existed (Coşkun and Çakmak 2005, Sertöz and Mete 2005, Oğuzhanoğlu and Özdel 2005, Karadağ et al. 2010, Akbiyık et al. 2012, Sarandöl et al. 2013, Şafak et al. 2014, Ulupınar 2014, Bulduk et al. 2015, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Demir 2017, Şener 2017, Varma et al. 2017, Demir 2018a, Demir 2018b). In studies where there was no control group, the effectiveness of therapy was evaluated by comparing the pre- and post-test scores of the participants.

Table 1. Features of CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy effectiveness studies

Study and method	Sample	Groups	Drop-Out	Measures	Follow-up	Scal es	Duration	# of sessions	# of therapists	Diagnosis	Outcome
Coşkun et al. (2005) Psychodrama	10 (Gender ?)	Experiment group	2	Pre-test post-test	None	SCS, STAS, TAÖ, SIB	90 min	8	?	People receiving treatment for addiction	Reductions in the fear of incompetency
Oğuzhanoğlu et al. (2005) Psychodrama	11 (M)	Experiment group	5	Pre-test post-test	None	HAS, GDS	150-180 min	18	1	Normal population	Improvement in psychological and behavioral domains
Sertöz et al. (2005) CBT	19 (F)	11 experiment	?	Pre-test post-test	8 weeks	SCL-90-R,	90 min	8	1	Obesity	Improvement in weight loss, psychiat-

		8 experiment		Follow-up		SF-36, BDI, RSES, BPS, STAI					ric symptoms, and pain reduction
Karataş et al. (2009) Psychodrama	23 Adolescents (12 F, 11 M)	11 experiment 12 control	?	Pre-test post-test Follow-up	16 weeks	AS, TAA, SS	90-120 min	14	1	Normal population	Effective in reducing aggression but not in physical aggression
Karadağ et al. (2010) Psychodrama	7 (F)	Experiment group	3	Pre-test post-test	None	BDI, STAI, CSS	180 min	18	1	Psoriasis	Significant effect on coping styles
Mortan et al. (2010) CBT	12 (M)	12 Experiment 5 Control	?	Pre-test post-test Follow-up	1 Years	SAPS, SAN S, SS, PSAS, RSES, BAI, BHS, HDS, HAS, BDI, ISS	90 min	9-10	2	Schizophrenia and Schizoaffective disorder	It has been shown to be effective in reducing and coping with auditory hallucinations.
Sütçü et al. (2010) CBT	40 Adolescents (22 F, 18 M)	11 Experiment 11 Control 8 Experiment 10 Control	8	Pre-test post-test Follow-up	6 Months	TAA, SS, CATS, NAI-SF	90 min	12	2	Anger and Aggression	Significant improvements were found in anger and aggression measurements.
Karataş (2011) Psychodrama	36 Adolescents (18 F, 18 M)	12 Experiment 12 Control 12 Placebo	?	Pre-test post-test Follow-up	12 Weeks	CRB, DS	90-120 min	10	?	Normal population	It was found that adolescents had an impact on conflict resolution skills.
Akbiyik et al. (2012) Psychodrama	33 (F)	12 Experiment 11 Experiment 10 Experiment	?	Pre-test post-test	None	MPS, SS	120 min	12	2	Breast Cancer	There was a significant increase in perceived social support.
Sarandöl et al. (2013) Art therapy	16 (8 F, 8 M)	Experiment group	?	Pre-test post-test	None	PNS, ÇŞD, Ö, SO-FAS, KCSS, BDI,	90 min	17	2	Schizophrenia and patient relatives	Improvement in negative schizophrenia symptoms and depression.

Şafak et al. (2014) CBT	37 (28 F, 9 M)	10 Experiment 10 Experiment 9 Experiment 8 Experiment	?	Pre-test post-test	Non e	BAI BAI, BDI, Y- BOC S, Y- BOC S-SC	90-120 min	14	4	OC	Significant improvement was observed in OCD symptoms.
Karataş (2014) Psycho- drama	45 (21 F, 24 M)	15 Experiment 15 Control 15 Placebo	2	Pre-test post-test Follow- up	10 Weeks	SWS, BHS	90-120 min	12	1	Normal popula- tion	It was found that subjective well-being scores increased and hopelessness scores decreased significantly.
Ulupınar (2014) Psycho- drama	10 (Gender ?)	Experi- ment group	2	Pre-test post-test Follow- up	1 Years	PSS	180 min	21	1	Normal popula- tion	Improvements in self- evaluation, awareness, expressing feelings and thoughts, creativity, empathy and problem solving skills were found.
Bal et al. (2015) Psycho- drama	18 (10 F, 8 M)	9 Experi- ment 9 Control	?	Pre-test post-test	Non e	OD- NPS, MM MPQ	120 min	11	?	Normal popula- tion	It has been shown to reduce psychosomatic pain.
Bulduk et al. (2015) Art therapy	16 (10 F, 6 M)	Experi- ment group	?	Pre-test post-test	Non e	SMM T	?	11-12	1	Mild dementia	No significant difference between groups was found.
Öngider et al. (2015) CBT	24 Children (12 F, 12 M)	6 Experi- ment 6 Control 6 Experi- ment 6 Control	?	Pre-test post-test	Non e	STAI -I VE II	90 min	12	?	Anxiety disorders	Effective in reducing anxiety.
Gökkaya et al. (2016) Psycho- drama	14 (13 F, 1 M)	Experi- ment group	2	Pre-test post-test	Non e	MBS, LSS BDI, BHS	240 min	16	1	Normal popula- tion	It has been found to be effective in decreasing the professional burnout and increasing the life satisfaction of the guidance counselors.
Demir (2017) Art therapy	11 (9 F, 2 M)	Experi- ment group	?	Pre-test post-test	Non e	BSI, BHS, ATQ, NFA S	180 min	9	?	Normal popula- tion	It was found to have a positive effect on hopelessness, automatic

											thoughts, dysfunctional attitudes and reducing symptom levels.
Varma et al. (2017) Psychodrama	9 (8 F, 1 M)	Experiment group	7	Pre-test post-test	None	HAM-D17	180 min	16	1	Mild to moderate Major Depressive Disorder	Contributed to the treatment of depression.
Şener (2017) Psychodrama	9 (4 F, 5 M)	Experiment group	3	Pre-test post-test	None	LSPSS	90-120 min	21	1	social phobia	It can be said that it has a significant effect on young people with social anxiety symptoms.
Gedik et al. (2018) CBT	22 Children (16 F, 6 M)	5 Experiment 6 Experiment 11 Control	3	Pre-test post-test	None	SCARED, STAI-C, DSC	90 min	9	2	Children with high levels of anxiety	There is some evidence that it is effective in reducing anxiety symptoms.
Bakalım et al. (2018) Psychodrama	46 (24 F, 22 M)	23 Experiment, 23 Control	?	Pre-test post-test	None	SSS	180 min	8	1	Normal population	Improvements in self-compassion, common humanity, and mindfulness. Reduced self-judgment, isolation, and over-identification.
Demir (2018a) CBT	12 (4 F, 8 M)	Experiment group	3	Pre-test post-test	None	BDI, BHS	90 min	10	?	Visual impairment	Depressive symptoms and hopelessness levels decreased significantly.
Demir (2018b) Art therapy	10 (6 F, 4 M)	Experiment group	?	Pre-test post-test	None	BAI, LSAS, HAI	180 min	7	?	Normal population	It was found to be effective in reducing social anxiety and health anxiety, but not in reducing overall anxiety.
Demir et al. (2018) Art therapy	22 (15 F, 7 M)	11 Experiment 11 Placebo	?	Pre-test post-test	None	BSI	120 min	8	2	Normal population	There was a significant difference between depression and anger variables and there was no significant difference in reducing paranoid thoughts and psychoticism.

Gökkaya et al. (2018) CBT	54 Children (35 F, 29 M)	20 Experi- ment 18 Control 16 Placebo	5	Pre-test post- test Follow- up	4 mon ths	ICRB -C, CSEI- SF, PBS- CFBT	120 min	13	1	Normal popu- lation	It was found that the cognition score related to bullying decreased.
------------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	--	-----------------	---	---------	----	---	------------------------	---

?: Unspecified, AS: Aggression Scale, ATQ: Automatic Thoughts Questionnaire, BAI: Beck Anxiety Inventory, BDI: Beck Depression Inventory, BHEÖ: Brunsstrom Hemiplegia Recovery Staging Scale, BHS: Beck Hopelessness Scale, BPS: Body Perception Scale, BSI: Brief Symptom Inventory, CATS: Children's Action Tendency Scale, CRRBS: Conflict Resolution Behavior Determination Scale, CSEI-SF: Coopersmith Self-Esteem Inventory- Short Form, CSS: Coping with Stress Scale, DSC: Depression Scale for Children, GDS: Geriatric Depression Scale, HAI: The Health Anxiety Inventory, HAM-D17: Hamilton Depression Rating Scale, HAS: Hamilton Anxiety Scale, HDS: Hamilton Depression Scale, ICRB-C: Inventory of Cognitions Related Bullying for Children, ISS: Information Scale about Schizophrenia, KCSS: Kingston Caregiver Stress Scale, LSAS: Liebowitz Social Anxiety Scale, LSPSS: Liebowitz Social Phobia Symptoms Scale, LSS: Life Satisfaction Scale, MBS: Maslach Burnout Scale, MPMPO: Multidimensional McGill Melzack Pain Questionnaire, MPSS: Multidimensional Perceived Social Support Scale, NAI-SF: Novaco Anger Inventory Short Form, NFAS: Non-Functional Attitudes Scale, ODNPS: One-dimensional Numerical Pain Scale, PBS-CFBT: Peer Bullying Scale Child Form -Bully Test, PNS: Pozitif Negatif Sendrom Skalası, PSAS: Problem / Symptom Assessment Scale, PSS: Problem Solving Scale, RSES: Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, SANS: Symptoms Assessment Negative Scale, SAPS: Symptoms Assessment Positive Scale, SCARED: Screen for Child Anxiety Related Emotional Disorders, SCL-90R: Revised Symptom Check List, SCS: Social Comparison Scale, SF-36: SF 36 Quality of Life Assessment Scale, SIB: the Scale for Interpersonal Behaviour, SMMT: Standardized Mini-Mental Test, SOFAS: Social and Occupational Functioning Assessment Scale, SS: Satisfaction Scale, SSS: Self-Sensitivity Scale, STAI: State-Trait Anxiety Scale, STA-IVELI: State-Trait Anxiety Scale for Children, STAI-C: State-Trait Anxiety Inventory for Children, STAS: State-Trait Anger Scale, SWBS: Subjective Well-Being Scale, TAS: Toronto Alekstimi Scale, TAASS: Trait Anger and Anger Style Scale, Y-BOCS: Yale-Brown Obsession Compulsion Scale, Y-BOCS-SC: Yale-Brown Obsession Compulsion Symptom Checklist, Female: Female, Girls, M: Male, Boys

Measures

In most CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy effectiveness studies, self-report measures which were administered before and after the intervention were used. In Oğuzhanoğlu and Özdel's (2005) study, both self-report and clinician rated instruments were used before and after the intervention; while in Varma et al.'s (2017) study, only clinician rated instruments were administered. The studies used different instruments due to the fact that they addressed different topics within various populations. The instruments used in the studies were presented in Table 1. Most commonly used instruments were the Beck Depression Inventory (Sertöz and Mete 2005, Karadağ et al. 2010, Mortan et al. 2010, Sarandöl et al. 2013, Şafak et al. 2014, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Demir 2018a), Beck Anxiety Inventory (Mortan et al. 2010, Sarandöl et al. 2013, Şafak et al. 2014, Demir 2018b, Yazkaç and Özkan 2018), Beck Hopelessness Scale (Mortan et al. 2010, Karataş 2014, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Demir 2017, Demir 2018a), Trait Anxiety Scale for Children (Öngider and Baykara 2015, Gedik et al. 2018), and the Aggression Scale (Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Karataş 2011).

Frequency of measurements

All studies conducted pre-test and post-test measurements in order to examine effectiveness but some studies also included follow-up measurements in order to evaluate the long-term effects of treatment. Among CBGT effectiveness studies, Gökkaya and Sütcü (2018) had a 4-month follow-up measurement, Sütcü et al. (2010) had a 6-month follow-up, Mortan et al. (2010) and Sertöz and Mete (2005) had a 12-month follow-up. In psychodrama studies, Karataş (2014) had a 10-week follow-up, Karataş and Gökçakan (2009) had a 16-week follow-up, Ulupınar (2014) had a 12-month follow-up, and Karataş (2011) had a 2-week follow-up. It was found that art therapy effectiveness studies did not take follow-up measurements.

Content and delivery of group psychotherapy in the studies

Techniques applied

Among CBGT studies, one study did not provide any information on the techniques used (Sertöz and Mete 2005). In the remaining 7 articles, five (Sütcü et al. 2010, Şafak et al. 2014, Öngider and Baykara 2015, Gedik et al. 2018, Demir 2018a) explicitly stated the techniques used, while two (Mortan et al. 2010, Gökkaya and Sütcü 2018) reported techniques within session contents. The mostly used techniques were cognitive restruc-

turing, psychoeducation, and homeworks. Five studies used cognitive restructuring (Mortan et al. 2010, Sütcü et al. 2010, Demir 2018a, Gedik et al. 2018, Gökkaya and Sütcü 2018), while 5 used psychoeducation (Mortan et al. 2010, Sütcü et al. 2010, Şafak et al. 2014, Gedik et al. 2018, Gökkaya and Sütcü 2018), and 4 used homeworks (Sütcü et al. 2010, Şafak et al. 2014, Öngider and Baykara 2015, Gedik et al. 2018).

Among art therapy effectiveness studies, 2 (Bulduk et al. 2015, Yazkaç and Özkan 2018) explicitly stated the techniques used, while the remaining 4 studies mentioned the techniques used within session contents. In all studies, the drawing technique was used. The remaining studies mostly used music (Sarandöl et al. 2013, Demir 2017, Demir and Demir 2018) and postcard techniques (Demir 2017, Demir 2018b, Demir and Demir 2018). In one of the psychodrama effectiveness studies (Akbiyık et al. 2012), techniques used were not mentioned. In 3 studies, the psychodrama trials were explained but techniques were not explicitly stated (Karataş 2011, Ulupınar 2014, Bakalım et al. 2018). In the remaining 9 articles, the mostly used techniques included role reversal, pairing, and mirroring. In 8 studies, both role reversal and pairing were used (Coşkun and Çakmak 2005, Oğuzhanoglu and Özdel 2005, Karadağ et al. 2010, Karataş 2014, Bal and Şener 2015, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Varma et al. 2017, Şener 2017), while in 4 studies the mirroring technique was used (Coşkun and Çakmak 2005, Oğuzhanoglu and Özdel 2005, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Varma et al. 2017).

Duration and number of sessions

In one study (Bulduk et al. 2015) no information on the duration of sessions was provided. In the remaining 26 studies, sessions mostly lasted for 90 minutes (Coşkun and Çakmak 2005, Sertöz and Mete 2005, Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Mortan et al. 2010, Sarandöl et al. 2013, Öngider and Baykara 2015, Demir 2018a) and the maximum session duration was found to be 240 minutes (Gökkaya and Özdel 2016). The number of sessions changed between 7 (Demir 2018b) and 21 (Ulupınar 2014, Şener 2017).

Number of members and therapists

All studies reported the number of group members. Among the studies, the minimum number of members in the experiment group was 7 (Mortan et al. 2010), while the maximum was 25 members (Yazkaç and Özkan 2018). As for control groups, the minimum number of members was 5 (Mortan et al. 2010) and the maximum was 25 members (Yazkaç and Özkan 2018). Seven of the studies did not provide information regarding the number of therapists. In the remaining 13 studies, a single therapists conducted group therapy (Oğuzhanoglu and Özdel 2005, Sertöz and Mete 2005, Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Karadağ et al. 2010, Ulupınar 2014, Karataş 2014, Bulduk et al. 2015, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Şener 2017, Varma et al. 2017, Bakalım et al. 2018, Gökkaya and Sütcü 2018, Yazkaç and Özkan 2018). In 6 studies, there were two therapists (Sarandöl et al. 2013, Mortan et al. 2010, Sütcü et al. 2010, Akbiyık et al. 2012, Demir and Demir 2018, Gedik et al. 2018) and in one study, there were four therapists (Şafak et al. 2014). Information on the number of co-therapists was provided in only 7 articles. Among these, 4 (Sertöz and Mete 2005, Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Akbiyık et al. 2012, Bakalım et al. 2018) had two co-therapists, while 3 (Karadağ et al. 2010, Gökkaya and Özdel 2016, Varma et al. 2017) had a single co-therapist. Also, 9 studies stated that the therapists were supervised. In all of these 9 studies, supervision was received from a single

therapist (Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Mortan et al. 2010, Karadağ et al. 2010, Sütçü et al. 2010, Ulupınar 2014, Gökçaya and Özdel 2016, Varma et al. 2017, Gedik et al. 2018, Gökçaya and Sütçü 2018).

Discussion

Individual and group psychotherapy techniques based on various theoretical approaches and for different problems are used today. Compared to individual psychotherapy, group psychotherapy practices are known to have some advantages including fostering communication skills via the interaction between group members (Corey 2008) and having low costs (Flannery-Schroeder et al. 2005). The effectiveness of these methods which are used for alleviating various psychological disorders and life problems are measured via various scientific studies. Studies which examine the effectiveness of treatment/therapy modalities are referred to as experimental methods. In Turkey, a large number of experimental studies evaluate the effectiveness of different psychotherapy techniques (Güven and Gökçe 2018). The psychotherapy techniques evaluated for effectiveness include CBT, schema therapy, solution focused therapy, art therapy, and psychodrama (Rezaeian et al. 1997, Kipper and Ritchie 2003, Sütçü 2016, Körük and Özabacı 2018). In the current study, Turkish CBGT, art therapy, and psychodrama effectiveness studies conducted between the years 2000-2018 were examined. These studies were evaluated in terms of methods, therapy features, and outcomes. As a result, we could not find any CBGT, art therapy, and psychodrama effectiveness studies conducted in Turkey between the years 2000-2005. Accordingly, it can be said that CBGT, art therapy, and psychodrama effectiveness studies were mostly conducted in the last 14 years.

Considering that 13 of the 27 studies examined included psychodrama oriented group psychotherapy, it is possible to claim that among psychosocial treatments, psychodrama is the a common intervention used in Turkey. Examination of other studies showed that CBGT is more common than art therapy. It was determined that some of the studies examined addressed anxiety (Şener 2017, Gedik et al. 2018, Demir 2018b), aggression (Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Sütçü et al. 2010), conflict resolution (Karataş 2011, Ulupınar 2014), and OCD (Şafak et al. 2014). In the international literature CBGT, art therapy, and psychodrama effectiveness studies addressed the aforementioned problems (Hofmann et al. 2012, Kipper and Ritchie 2003, Slayton et al. 2010). It was observed that the CBGT, art therapy, and psychodrama effectiveness studies conducted in Turkey Show similarities with those conducted in other countries.

Psychodrama was found to be effective in 12 studies. However, in Karataş and Gökçakan's (2009) study, significant post-treatment differences in terms of the outcome variables could not be observed. It was found that art therapy was effective as reported in 3 studies. On the other hand, 3 studies (Bulduk et al. 2015, Demir 2018b, Demir and Demir 2018) reported there were no significant differences in terms of the outcome variables. The 8 studies which examined the effectiveness of CBGT, all reported the intervention to be effective. In this context, it is possible to say that CBGT is more effective than psychodrama and art therapy.

In experimental studies, changes occurring in the dependent variable are measured both in the experiment and control groups. These two groups can also be compared to a third group. The intervention applied to this third group is symbolic and does not involve therapeutic or active content. This comparison group is called a placebo group. Expe-

rimental designs with a placebo group produce more sound findings (Büyüköztürk et al. 2017). It was found that among the studies examined, only 11 had a control group and 4 had a placebo group. This can be seen as an important limitation of the effectiveness studies. It would be beneficial that future studies use both control and placebo groups to demonstrate effectiveness of interventions.

In experimental studies, post-test measurements are taken in order to determine the effectiveness of interventions applied. On the other hand, follow-up measurements are needed to determine the permanence of treatment effects (Erkuş 2016). Among then 27 studies examined, only 8 (Sertöz and Mete 2005, Karataş and Gökçakan 2009, Mortan et al. 2010, Sütcü et al. 2010, Karataş 2011, Karataş 2014, Ulupınar 2014, Gökkaya and Sütcü 2018) included follow-up measurements. It is thought that study designs should include follow-up measurements in order to investigate long-term treatment effects. Methods used in the effectiveness studies examined were in line with the literature. It was determined that techniques including relaxation, cognitive restructuring, and psychoeducation in CBGT (Ruiz 2012). In psychodrama pairing, mirroring, and role reversal techniques are mostly used (Cruz et al. 2018). In art therapy, music, movement, and drawing techniques were most frequently used (Dunphy et al. 2014).

Duration and number of sessions varied across studies. In a CBGT effectiveness study, Demir (2018a) conducted 10 sessions which lasted for 90 minutes. In Sarandöl et al.'s (2013) study, the effectiveness of art therapy was investigated and a total of 17 sessions which lasted for 90 minutes were carried out. In a psychodrama effectiveness study by Oğuzhanoğlu and Özdel (2005), 18 sessions which lasted for 150-180 minutes were conducted. These findings are in parallel to the literature. Some CBGT effectiveness studies included 14 sessions (Galassi et al. 2007, Roberge et al. 2008). Some studies had a lower number of sessions, with a 4-session art therapy (Gussak 2007) and a 5-session CBGT (Rufer et al. 2010). In Demir's study (2018b), art therapy lasted for 7 sessions and in Sertöz and Mete's study (2005), CBGT lasted for 8 sessions. In a psychodrama study conducted by Tarashoeva et al. (2017), 90-minute 10 sessions were carried out within 3 months. In another psychodrama effectiveness study, 3-hour 25 sessions were conducted within 6 months (Dorothea 2016).

The number of group members and therapists examined in the effectiveness studies were similar to those in international studies. For example, in Gedik et al.'s study (2018), two therapists worked with the experiment group consisting of 5-6 participants. Similarly, in a CBGT study carried out by Thimm and Antonsen (2014), two therapists worked with 5-7 experiment group members. In a psychodrama effectiveness study by Ulupınar (2014), a single therapist delivered psychodrama to 8 members. In Dorothea's (2016) study, psychodrama was delivered to 5 members by a single therapist. Yazkaç and Özkan (2018) provided art therapy to 50 participants using a single therapist. In an art therapy effectiveness study by Gussak (2007), the number of group members and therapists were 39 and 2, respectively.

A total of 27 CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy effectiveness studies conducted in Turkey between the years 2000-2018 were examined. It was determined that these studies showed similarities to the international literature in terms of the number of participants/therapists, duration and number of sessions, and the techniques used. Also it is possible to conclude that CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy are effective in the treatment of various psychological disorders and problems.

Conclusion

This study was conducted in order to examine CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy effectiveness studies conducted in Turkey. It can be assumed that CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy are effective in the treatment of various psychological disorders. In conclusion, group psychotherapy, being an effective treatment modality, can be used more widespread. Although data on group psychotherapy and its effectiveness is limited in Turkey, it was determined that such studies increased in the last years. It is suggested to take follow-up measurements in examining the long-term effectiveness of these therapies. Also it would be beneficial to include both control and placebo groups in the design of effectiveness studies. Finally, it is suggested to compare the effectiveness of various established group psychotherapy methods in future studies. This study was conducted in order to examine CBGT, psychodrama, and art therapy effectiveness studies conducted in Turkey between the years 2000-2018. It is recommended that future studies reach older research and investigate other psychotherapy methods. Also, thesis and dissertations on the topic can also be examined. Conducting future studies which expand the scope of this review may contribute to our understanding of the state of group psychotherapies in Turkey.

References

- Akbiyık Dİ, Soygür H, Karabulut E (2012) Psiko-onkoloji ve aile hekimliğinde ruh sağlığını güçlendirme: Sosyal destek algısı ve psikodrama grup terapisi uygulamaları. *Anadolu Psikiyatri Derg*, 13:205-209.
- Altınay D (1999) Psikodrama Grup Psikoterapisi: 300 Isınma Oyunu, 2. Baskı. İstanbul, Sistem Yayıncılık.
- Arslantaş H, Dereboy İF (2016) Psikiyatri servislerinde yapılandırılmış grup psikoterapisi: kişilerarası ilişkisel rol analizi. *Türkiye Klinikleri Journal of Psychiatric Nursing-Special Topics*, 2:34-38.
- Aydın B (2012) Tıbbi sanat terapisi. *Psikiyatride Güncel Yaklaşımlar*, 4:69-83.
- Bakalım O, Yörüük C, Şensoy G (2018) Psikodrama grup yaşantısının rehberlik ve psikolojik danışmanlık öğrencilerinin öz-duyarlık düzeylerine etkisi. *Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 17:949-968.
- Bal PN, Şener Ö (2015) Psikosomatik hastalıkların iyileştirilmesinde psikodramanın etkisi. *Uluslararası Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*, (5):310-323.
- Beck JS (2001) *Bilişsel Terapi: Temel İlkeler ve Ötesi Alanı* (Çeviri Ed. H Şahin). Ankara, Türk Psikologlar Derneği Yayınları.
- Braga DT, Cordioli AV, Niederauer K, Manfro GG (2005) Cognitive-behavioral group therapy for obsessive-compulsive disorder: a 1 - year follow-up. *Acta Psychiatr Scand*, 112: 180-186.
- Bulduk S, Usta E, Dinçer Y, Bayram S (2015) Demanslı yaşlılara uygulanan sanat terapi yönteminin bilişsel durum üzerine etkisinin incelenmesi. 1. Ulusal Toplumsal Ve Kurumsal Çatışmalar/Çözümler Kongresi, 8-10 Ekim 2015 Düzce, Türkiye. *Bildiriler Kitabı sayfa:103-114*.
- Büyüköztürk Ş (2016) *Deneysel Desenler: Öntest-Sontest Kontrol Grubu Desen ve Veri Analizi*. Ankara, PEGEM Akademi.
- Corey G (2008) *Theory and Practice of Group Counseling*, 7th ed. Belmont, CA, Books/Cole-Cengage.
- Coşkun B, Çakmak D (2005) Alkol ve madde bağımlılarının grup psikoterapisinde psikodramanın kullanılması. *Bağımlılık Dergisi*, 6:103-110.
- Cruz A, Sales C, Alves P, Moita G (2018) The core techniques of Morenian Psychodrama: A systematic review of literature. *Front Psychol*, 9:1263.
- Cully JA, Teten AL (2008) *A Therapist's Guide To Brief Cognitive Behavioral Therapy*. Huston, Department of Veterans Affairs, South Central Mental Illness Research, Education, and Clinical Center (MIRECC).
- Demir V (2017) Dışavurumcu sanat terapisinin psikolojik belirtiler ile bilişsel işlevlere etkisi. *Uluslararası Toplum Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 7:575-598.
- Demir V (2018a) Bilişsel-davranışçı yaklaşıma dayalı grup terapisi programının görme yetersizliği olan bireylerde depresif belirti ve umutsuzluk düzeylerine etkisi. *Türkiye Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 22:85-104.

- Demir V (2018b) Sanatla terapi programının bireylerin kaygı, sosyal kaygı ve sağlık kaygısı düzeyleri üzerine etkisi. *Uluslararası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 1:223-234.
- Demir V, Demir A (2018) Sanatla terapi programı ve etkileşim grubu uygulamasının ruhsal belirti düzeyleri üzerindeki etkisi. *Türkiye Bütüncül Psikoterapi Dergisi*, 1:97-120.
- Dorothea G (2016) Effectiveness of psychodrama group therapy on pupils with mathematics anxiety. *Z Psychodrama Soziometr*, 15(Suppl):197-215.
- Dunphy K, Elton M, Jordan A (2014) Exploring dance/movement therapy in post-conflict Timor-Leste. *Am J Dance Ther*, 36:189-208.
- Flannery-Schroeder E, Choudhury MS, Kendall PC (2005) Group and individual cognitive-behavioral treatments for youth with anxiety disorders: 1-year follow-up. *Cognit Ther Res*, 29:253-259.
- Galassi F, Quercioli S, Charismas D, Niccolai V, Barciulli E (2007) Cognitive-behavioral group treatment for panic disorder with agoraphobia. *J Clin Psychol*, 63:409-416.
- Gedik Z, Gökkaya F, Tekinsav Sütcü S (2018) Kaygılı çocuklara yönelik okul temelli bir bilişsel davranışçı grup terapisi programının etkililiği: pilot bir çalışma. *Uludağ Üniversitesi Fen-Edebiyat Fakültesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 19:91-121.
- Gökkaya F, Özdel O (2016) Rehber öğretmenlerin mesleki tükenmişliğini azaltmada psikodramanın etkililiği. *Anadolu Psikiyatri Derg*, 17:354-361.
- Gökkaya F, Sütcü ST (2018) İlköğretim öğrencilerinde zorbalık eğilimini azaltmaya yönelik bilişsel davranışçı bir müdahale programının geliştirilmesi ve etkililiğinin değerlendirilmesi. *Eğitim ve Bilim*, 43:91-108.
- Gussak D (2007) The effectiveness of art therapy in reducing depression in prison populations. *Int J Offender Ther Comp Criminol*, 51:444-460.
- Güney M (2011) Sanat ve Psikiyatri. Ankara, Öz Baran Ofset.
- Güven E, Gökçe G (2018) Etkililik çalışmaları ne kadar etkili: Bilişsel davranışçı terapi bağlamında bir değerlendirme. *Türk Psikiyatri Derg*, 29:54-66.
- Hofmann SG, Asnaani A, Vonk IJ, Sawyer AT, Fang A (2012) The efficacy of cognitive behavioral therapy: A review of meta-analyses. *Cognit Ther Res*, 36:427-440.
- Karadağ F, Kalkan Oğuzhanoğlu N, Özdel O, Ergin Ş, Kaçar N (2010) Psöriyazis hastalarında psikodrama: stres ve stresle baş etme. *Anadolu Psikiyatri Derg*, 11:220-227.
- Karataş Z (2011) Psikodrama teknikleri kullanılarak yapılan grup uygulamasının ergenlerin çatışma çözme becerilerine etkisinin incelenmesi. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Bilimleri*, 11:601-614.
- Karataş Z (2014) Psikodrama uygulamasının üniversite öğrencilerinin öznel iyi oluş ve umutsuzlukları üzerindeki etkisi. *Eğitim ve Bilim*, 39:118-128.
- Karataş Z, Gökçakan Z (2009) Psikodrama teknikleri kullanılarak yapılan grup uygulamalarının ergenlerde saldırganlığı azaltmadaki etkisinin incelenmesi. *Türk Psikiyatri Derg*, 20:357-366.
- Kızılkaya S, Gündüz O (2012) Özürlüler Yerel Hizmet Rehberi "İsöm Modeli". İstanbul, İBB Basımevi.
- Kipper DA, Ritchie TD (2003) The effectiveness of psychodramatic techniques: a meta-analysis. *Group Dyn*, 7:13-25.
- Körük S, Özabacı N (2018) Şema terapinin depresif bozuklukların tedavisindeki etkililiği: Bir meta-analiz. *Psikiyatride Güncel Yaklaşımlar*, 10:470-480.
- Kramer GP, Phares V, Bernstein DA (2014) *Klinik Psikolojiye Giriş (Çeviri Ed. İ Dağ)*. Ankara, Mentis Yayıncılık.
- Lee HJ, Jang SH, Lee SY, Hwang KS (2015) Effectiveness of dance/movement therapy on affect and psychotic symptoms in patients with schizophrenia. *Arts Psychother*, 45:64-68.
- Linden W, Hewitt PL (2015) *Klinik Psikoloji: Bir Modern Sağlık Uzmanlık Alanı (Çeviri Ed. M Şahin)*. İstanbul, Nobel Akademik Yayıncılık.
- Malchiodi CA (2012) *Handbook of Art Therapy*, 2nd Ed. London, Guilford Press.
- Mennuti RB, Christner RW, Freeman A (2006) *Cognitive-Behavioral Interventions in Educational Settings: A Handbook for Practice*. New York, Routledge.
- Mortan O, Tekinsav Sütcü S, German Köse G (2010) İşitsel halüsinasyonlarla başa çıkmaya yönelik bilişsel-davranışçı bir grup müdahalesinin etkililiği: bir pilot çalışma. *Türk Psikiyatri Derg*, 21:1-10.
- O'Connor T, Creswell C (2005) Cognitive-behavioural therapy for children and adolescents. *Psychiatry*, 4:123-125.

- Oğuzhanoğlu NK, Özdel O (2005) Yaşlılık, huzurevi ve yaşam yolculukları bir psikodrama grup çalışması. *Turk Psikiyatri Derg*, 16:124-132.
- Öngider N, Baykara B (2015) Anksiyete tanısı almış çocuklar üzerinde bilişsel davranışçı grup terapisinin etkililiği. *Bilişsel Davranışçı Psikoterapi ve Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 1:26-37.
- Özbek A, Leutz G (2003) Psikodrama, Grup Psikoterapisinde Sahnesel Etkileşim, 2. Baskı. Ankara, Ayrıntı Basımevi.
- Öztürk O (2008) Psikanaliz ve Psikoterapi, 4. Baskı. İstanbul, Nobel Tıp Kitabevi.
- Rezaeian MP, Mazumdar DPS, Sen AK (1997) The effectiveness of psychodrama in changing the attitudes among depressed patients. *Journal of Personality and Clinical Studies*, 13:19–23.
- Roberge P, Marchand A, Reinhartz D, Savard P (2008) Cognitive-behavioral treatment for panic disorder with agoraphobia: a randomized, controlled trial and cost-effectiveness analysis. *Behav Modif*, 32:333–351.
- Rose SD (1998) *Group Therapy with Troubled Youth: A Cognitive Behavioral Interactive Approach*. Thousand Oaks, Sage.
- Rufer M, Albrecht R, Schmidt O, Zaum J, Schnyder U, Hand I et al (2010) Changes in quality of life following cognitive-behavioral group therapy for panic disorder. *Eur Psychiatry*, 25:8–14.
- Ruiz FJ (2012). Acceptance and commitment therapy versus traditional cognitive behavioral therapy: A systematic review and meta-analysis of current empirical evidence. *International Journal of Psychology and Psychological Therapy*, 12:333–357.
- Sarandöl A, Akkaya C, Eracar N, Kırılı S (2013) Şizofreni hastaları ve yakınlarıyla yapılan sanatla terapinin hastalık belirtileri, bireysel ve toplumsal beceriler üzerine etkisi. *Anadolu Psikiyatri Derg*, 14:333-339.
- Sertöz ÖÖ, Mete HE (2005) Obezite tedavisinde bilişsel davranışçı grup terapisinin kilo verme, yaşam kalitesi ve psikopatolojiye etkileri: sekiz haftalık izlem çalışması. *Klinik Psikofarmakol Bulteni*, 15:119-126.
- Sharf RS (2016) *Theories of Psychotherapy and Counseling: Concepts and Cases*, 6th Edition. Boston, Cengage Learning.
- Slayton SC, D'Archer J, Kaplan F (2010) Outcome studies on the efficacy of art therapy: A review of findings. *Art Ther (Alex)*, 27:108-118.
- Sütcü ST, Aydın A, Sorias O (2010) Ergenlerde öfke ve saldırganlığı azaltmak için bilişsel davranışçı bir grup terapisi programının etkililiği. *Türk Psikoloji Dergisi*, 25:57-67.
- Şafak Y, Karadere ME, Özdel K, Özcan T, Türkçapar MH, Kuru E et al. (2014) Obsesif kompulsif bozuklukta bilişsel davranışçı grup psikoterapisinin etkinliğinin değerlendirilmesi. *Turk Psikiyatri Derg*, 25:225-33.
- Şener Ö (2017) Psikodramanın sosyal kaygısı olan üniversite öğrencileri üzerindeki pozitif etkisi. VI. Türkiye Lisansüstü Çalışmalar Kongresi, 10-13 Mayıs 2017 Muş, Türkiye. *Bildiriler Kitabı -III sayfa:151-160*.
- Tarashoeva G, Marinova-Djambazova P, Kojuharov H (2017) Effectiveness of psychodrama therapy in patients with panic disorders – final results. *International Journal of Psychotherapy: Psychodrama*, 21(2):55-66.
- Thimm JC, Antonsen L (2014) Effectiveness of cognitive behavioral group therapy for depression in routine practice. *BMC Psychiatry*, 14:292.
- Türkçapar MH (2015) *Bilişsel Terapi, Temel İlkeler ve Uygulama*, 9. Baskı. Ankara, HYB Yayıncılık.
- Ulupınar S (2014) Psikodrama uygulamasının hemşirelik öğrencilerinin sorun çözme becerisine etkisi. *Anadolu Psikiyatri Derg*, 15:55-62.
- Varma GS, Karadağ F, Kalkan Oğuzhanoğlu N, Özdel O (2017) Depresyon tedavisinde grup psikoterapisi ve psikodramanın yeri. *Klinik Psikiyatri Dergisi*, 20:308-317.
- Yalom I (2002) *Grup Psikoterapisinin Teori ve Pratiği*. İstanbul, Kabalıcı Yayınevi.
- Yazkaç P, Özkan Y (2018) Fizik tedavi ve rehabilitasyon hastaları üzerinde sanatla terapi çalışmalarının olumlu etkisi üzerine deneysel bir çalışma. *Sosyal Araştırmalar ve Davranış Bilimleri Dergisi*, 4:191-210.

Authors Contributions: All authors attest that each author has made an important scientific contribution to the study and has assisted with the drafting or revising of the manuscript.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

Conflict of Interest: No conflict of interest was declared by the authors.

Financial Disclosure: The authors declared that this study has received no financial support.